



# DRAFT

## City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 10, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
MICHAEL DRURY – Absent  
FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
ALEX PUJO – Present at 1:34 p.m.  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent  
PHIL SUDING – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:52 p.m.  
JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present at 1:35 p.m.  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, November 5, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Public Comment:
- No public comment.
- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 27, 2010**.
- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 27, 2010, with corrections.**
- Action: Suding/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Murray abstained. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.
- C. HLC Consent Calendar.
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item D which was reviewed by Robert Adams and Philip Suding.**
- Action: Boucher/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.
- D. Approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee Consent meeting of **October 27, 2010**, as reviewed by the HLC Sign Committee.
- Motion: To continue the approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee meeting of October 27, 2010, to the next HLC meeting.**
- Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.
- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Commissioner Boucher announced that the Council Ordinance Committee met November 9<sup>th</sup>. Renee Brooke, Zoning Enforcement Supervisor, stated that of greater discussion were real estate "For Sale" signs in the right-of-way and video display signs at gasoline stations. Those topics were referred to the City Council for further discussion.
  2. Commissioner Boucher announced that the Citizens Planning Association will be hosting the 2010 Brinkerhoff Holiday Block Party on December 5.
  3. Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, announced that correspondence was received from Trevor Martinson with respect to the General Plan designation of the El Encanto Hotel site. Mr. Limón assured the Commission that no changes are proposed for the site as a result of the General Plan Update. The City will not be changing from its current base density of three units per acre (R-2/4.0/R-H Zone).

4. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
  - a) Commissioners Drury and Shallenberger would be absent from the meeting.
  - b) The appeal hearing at the City Council that was scheduled for November 16<sup>th</sup> of the HLC's action on the 101 W. Canon Perdido Street project has been withdrawn.
  - c) Due to a city-mandated furlough, the next scheduled HLC meeting will take place on Tuesday, November 23<sup>rd</sup> instead of Wednesday, November 24<sup>th</sup>.
5. Commissioner Murray announced that she would be stepping down from Item 4, 1727 Prospect Avenue.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Adams and Pujo reported that they met with representatives from CalTrans, SBCAG and the City of Santa Barbara with respect to the Highway 101 improvements between Milpas Street and Hot Springs Road. The enhancement of the pedestrian and bicycle circulation between East Beach and Coast Village Road is a future project to be discussed.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

1. **205 CHAPALA ST**

**(1:56)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070  
Application Number: MST2010-00263  
Owner/Applicant: City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Applied Earthworks  
Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposed replacement of the Chapala Street - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek. The replacement bridge would be a single-span bridge consisting of a combination of precast and cast-in-place concrete slab with asphalt concrete or polyester concrete overlay on the deck for the road surfacing. City standard sidewalks would be added to both sides of the street on the bridge and would tie into the existing sidewalks along Chapala Street and Yanonali Street. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit to perform this work in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

**(Concept Review only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval.)**

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner  
Eugene Cunningham, Project Manager  
David Black, Landscape Architect  
Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Jessica Grant read a letter from George Johnson, City Creeks Division, expressing support for the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about fencing and reuse of stones.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would agree to keep the north abutment and replace it in-kind? 7/0  
How many Commissioners would agree with the Preferred Option? 7/0  
How many Commissioners would agree to not put pony trusses back? 7/0

This was the Commission's consensus:

1. The Commission agreed with the Preferred Option, which involves removal of the existing deck and replacing it with a smaller deck that would no longer expand over the abandoned portion of Chapala Street. The Preferred Option also includes a separate pedestrian bridge.
2. The Commission agreed to preserve the existing bridge's south abutment and to preserve or reproduce in-kind the bridge's north abutment.
3. The Commission did not support the use of the existing bridge's steel trusses with the preferred bridge design since the trusses would be relocated, thus losing any remaining historic merit.

(Commissioners Drury and Shallanberger were absent.)

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

### **2. PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

**(2:41)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002

Application Number: MST2010-00338

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

Designer: 505 Design

(Concept review of proposed enhancements to Paseo Nuevo including new identity elements at all five pedestrian entries, updated sidewalk kiosks and directories, new entry wall and paving elements, modifications to existing lighting plan, removal of north court rotunda element, and upgraded benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, and trash receptacles.)

**(Comments only. Proposed changes to sign program to be reviewed under SGN2010-00151 on this agenda.**

Present: Rick Beason, Development Manager  
Nick Igel, Designer  
Trey Lindle, Macerich Management Company  
Skip Kuhn, Vice President

Public comment opened at 2:55 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the busyness of the proposal.

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely.**

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****3. PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

**(3:12)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002

Application Number: SGN2010-00151

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

Property Manager: Macerich Management Company

(Concept review of a proposal to revise the existing **sign program** with updated wayfinding/trailblazer signage, updated logo typeface for better signage legibility, and the introduction of a new flag program.)

**(Comments only.)**

Present: Rick Beason, Development Manager  
Nick Igel, Designer  
Trey Lindle, Macerich Management Company  
Skip Kuhn, Vice President

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely.****Action:** Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.**CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED: PUBLIC HEARING****4. 1727 PROSPECT AVE**

R-2 Zone

**(3:43)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-142-004

Application Number: MST2008-00583

Owner: Phil Larson, Larson Family Trust

Architect: Amy Taylor

(This structure is **eligible for Structure of Merit designation**. This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 307 square foot, two-car detached garage and construct a new 678 square foot, detached three-car garage with 598 square feet of basement storage. Also proposed is to demolish the existing sandstone stairs and stair support walls next to the existing garage. Approval of the project would also permit the as-built flagstone steps at the center of the parcel, a sandstone tree well with new tree and landscaping, and new gravel path, planting beds, trees, site lighting, and decorative pots. A zoning modification is requested for the proposed new garage and basement storage to encroach into the front setback on this 11,105 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The existing two legal dwelling units on the lot are proposed to remain.)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Zoning Modification.)**

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer:**

1. The proposal is acceptable for the location of the garage as recommended by the Transportation Division.
2. The landscaping has a fine plant palette. Provide more details.
3. The exposed concrete masonry unit (CMU) should not be seen.
4. Use a more authentic stone than manufactured El Dorado product. Try to incorporate the existing sandstone step material into the project somewhere.

Action: Pujo/Adams, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

### **5. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2008-00387  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Proposal to deconstruct and seismically reconstruct an historic arbor, to match the original.)

**(Review of an Addendum Letter Report to the Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This Letter Report was requested to evaluate the proposed configuration of the elements at the east and west ends of the arbor.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
Patrick Eastlake, Representing Ownership

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff read the addendum report and concludes with the report's recommendations and conclusions with respect to modifying the drawings to allow for openness at the arbor.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****6. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(4:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2008-00387  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Proposal to deconstruct and seismically reconstruct an historic arbor, to match the original.)

**(Review After Final of a more authentic configuration of the elements at the east and west ends of the arbor.)**

Present: Patrick Eastlake, Representing Ownership  
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers and Courtney Miller, Landscape Architects

**Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final.**

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:07 P.M. TO 4:16 P.M. \*\***

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT****7. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(4:16)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2010-00342  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
Agent: Alexandra Cole  
Architect: Gensler  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers Inc.  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to rehabilitate an existing historic waterfall.)

**(Review of an Addendum Letter Report to the Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This Letter Report is focused on a proposed new landscape plan dated October 2010.)**



Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. He requested that the word “refurbishment” be changed to “rehabilitation” on page 6 of the report.

**Motion:** To accept the report with the request that on page 6 the word “refurbishment” be changed to “rehabilitation.”

**Action:** Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:19 P.M. TO 4:25 P.M. \*\***

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

#### **8. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(4:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST2010-00342

Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.

Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services

Agent: Alexandra Cole

Architect: Gensler

Architect: Henry Lenny

Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers Inc.

Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to rehabilitate an existing historic waterfall.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers and Courtney Miller, Landscape Architects

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about water features and the non-compliant steps.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. There should be two materials, not three, along the walks.
2. Existing sandstone is to be rehabilitated.
3. The bridge should be sandstone, if possible.
4. Place material other than a middle stanchion at the bottom of the stair, such as an obstruction of planting.

**Action:** Suding/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR (10:15):**

See separate meeting minutes.

**HLC CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)****CONSENT (NEW)****A. 1111 CHAPALA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-222-025  
Application Number: MST2010-00335  
Owner: 1111 Chapala Street, LLC  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal to replace three exterior doors on an existing office building.)

**Continued indefinitely to Staff.**

**CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)****B. 1303 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-014  
Application Number: MST2009-00371  
Owner: Bosse Toy Train Museum Inc.  
Architect: Edwards- Pitman Architects

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal for alterations to an existing, two-story, 2,300 square foot commercial building including a 51 square foot one-story addition at the rear, and the elimination of 153 square feet from the second story. Also proposed is to reconfigure the front entry to be handicapped-accessible, and the addition of one rooftop HVAC unit at the front, and two rooftop condensers on the rear side. There will be a net loss of 103 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

**Postponed indefinitely at Staff's request.**

**CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)****C. 1809 STANWOOD DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-143-005  
Application Number: MST2010-00322  
Owner: Linda Dye  
Applicant: Roy Harthorn

(This structure is a designated **Structure of Merit: "Flores Casita, former Flores Ranch."** Proposal for alterations to an existing structure including the replacement of porches and closet removed for seismic retrofit foundation replacement, and installation of a new roof. Also included is the installation of a new window to match existing and the restoration and rehabilitation of doors, windows, siding, trim, and finishes per original plan and photographic record.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

**Final Approval with the condition that gutters match roof color.**

**CONSENT (NEW)****D. 721 E COTA ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-110-004

Application Number: MST2010-00346

Owner: Santa Barbara High School District

Architect: Joe Wilcox

(This is a **City Landmark: "Santa Barbara Junior High School."** Courtesy review of a project at Santa Barbara Junior High School to remove one tree and replace it with landscaping, replacement of sidewalk entry paving, stairs, and handrail, and other minor site improvements.)

**The following recommendations were made:**

1. Palms in this location are less appropriate than a canopy tree.
2. Look at adjacent planting for inspiration for trees and shrubs.
3. Place taller material in back and shorter material in front.

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:46 P.M. \*\***